



C4 Innovations - OC Racial Equity Meeting

12.7.2020

Attendance: Julia Steinberg, Leah McCall, Holly Ellis, Ashley Burton, Audrey White, Tiffany Jones, Shannon Smith, Taylor Eberhart, Melanie Grund, Regina Cannon, Marc Craig, Genesis Garcia, Al Wolschleger, Erinn Johnson, Kirsten Elliott, Ernestine McRae, Maddie Jaks, Liz McLachlan, Sara Orris, Liliana Stoneback, Elizabeth Kelly, Robert Ford, Jayesh Patel, Beth Baker, Helaine Zack, Jill Anderson, Suzanne Kimmerly, Jeanette Felton

Introduction: Regina Cannon, Chief Equity & Impact Officer, Director of the national initiative SPARC: Supporting Partnerships for Anti-Racist Communities, C4 Innovations.

Racial Equity

- Race is the single best predictor of socio-economic outcomes
 - Includes housing stability, education, & health
- Race intersects with every other demographic
- Not because of race but because of racism

Shared Language and Concepts

- Equality: Treating everyone the same. We will not get to equality unless we get to equity. Have to get through equity to get to equality.
- Equity acknowledges that there are groups of folks from different demographics that have difference circumstances, and many times because of historical and current discrimination and racism against them, they are starting in a different place. So, we are going to take that into consideration. Equity is not about treating everyone the same, it's about giving people exactly what they need.
- Racial Equity: It is an outcome; a condition that we would reach if we could no longer predict someone's socio-economic outcomes by race. The other part is the process, which says that in every kind of strategy, program, decision that we are making, we must include those who are most impacted. Especially black, indigenous, and people of color as part of that process. If they are not included, then you are not doing racial equity.

Collective Impact

- Start with Common Purpose – have to decide what is it that we are going to tackle? What is our common purpose? Align our work and contributions.
- Community Engagement & Co-Production – As we are designing this program, engage folks with lived experience, and co-design with that community and the greater community because it impacts everyone. It is the entire community's responsibility.
- Work together to build relationships and trust. Take the time to talk about how we are going to work together. It's only when you have those relationships and trust is when you can get to results and accountability.
- Results and Accountability – must keep each other accountable.



Collective Impact Components:

- Common Agenda
- Shared Measurement
- Mutually Reinforcing Activity
- Continuous Communication
- Support

Racial Equity lens must be at the center

Achieve Equitable Results

- Systemic Factors
- Targeted Universalism – starting with universal goal, and finding out who’s not meeting that goal, then intervening to get folks what they need, equitably.

Inequities Across Systems

It’s not just Housing...

- State and local government agencies
- Political leadership
- Education
- Justice system
- Healthcare and treatment providers and staff
- Law enforcement, public safety and first responders

Align contributions around center goal. Everyone has a role to play. Strategy, policy, etc.

Homelessness and Housing Instability

- Native Americans are 4x as likely to experience homelessness as the general population
- Black Americans are 3x as likely to experience homelessness as the general population
- Pacific Islanders are 9x as likely to experience homelessness as the general population

Timeline Highlights

- 1970s–Present: Disparate Impact of Local Land Use Regulations
- 1968–Present: Housing Discrimination
 - Black and Latinx People were shown **fewer homes** and told about **fewer listings**

Oakland County Population

- White – 72%
- Black – 14%
- Native – 0%
- Asian – 8%
- Islander – 0%
- Other – 0%
- Two + - 2%

Oakland County Homeless Population

- Black – 67.14%
- White – 30.97%
- American Indian or Alaska Native – 0.71%
- Asian – 0.40%
- Client doesn’t know – 0.27%
- Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander – 0.27%
- Client Refused – 0.10%
- Data not collected – 0.10%



Questioning the Data

- What is your data telling you?
 - Look at health care, law enforcement and education outcomes. What is it showing us in terms of inequity, who is in our system, how are they doing?
- What is it obscuring?
 - What is it not showing us? For example, look at how long it takes to get into housing.
- What do you already know about racial inequity in your system?
- How did you come to those conclusions?
 - What is our tracking and how are we monitoring that? Public and transparent. Make sure the folks that are coming to those conclusions and analyzing the data are representative of those people behind the data.
- What more do you need to know?

Question the Systems

- Who's benefitting?
- Who's being harmed?
- Who's being left out?
- How do you know/what's your monitoring mechanism?
 - Do we know if what we are offering is actually working?
- What more do you need to know?

Goal: Collective Impact

- Stakeholders from different systems
- Align contributions
- Racial equity lens at center

Group Discussion

- New framework to view subtleties, question everything.
- Trauma informed response/racialized trauma informed care.
- Recognize in a diverse community how to thrive not just survive.
- Important to bring law enforcement to the table to collaborate with case managers & service providers.
- Make urban planning & exclusionary zones a part of the conversation.
- Short & long term planning.
- COVID lens- separation/social distancing, vaccine prioritization advocacy.

Build Results Statement – Population – Place – Condition of well being

- Everyone in MI to have safe stable housing in communities in which they can thrive.
 - Everyone in OC to have safe stable housing in communities in which they can thrive.
 - Specific population eg. – By the end of 2021 reduce disproportionality of black folks experiencing homelessness by 25%.

Group Discussion: Issues



- Housing Affordability - difficulty comfortable. of price range or neighborhood.
- Source of income discrimination - those receiving subsidies and on disability are discriminated against. The 3X monthly income rule that a lot of landlords implement is something that comes up a lot for folk with subsidies/HCVs.
- We need to build a case around source of income discrimination at the state level.
- The waivers are great to open options, but the units/landlords have more restrictions.
- Source of income discrimination is not relegated to one geographic area.
- The county doesn't have a lot of rental stock. The emphasis has been on home ownership.
- Folks are getting Section 8 vouchers, but have to return them because they can't find housing.
- Such a limited number of units with landlords that will accept criminal histories.
- Have been using landlord strategies, but the landlords can demand higher market rate.
- How can we expand out beyond Pontiac and give folks more choice?
- Transportation issues outside typical areas – lack of transportation to services such as grocery stores, healthcare/hospital, community amenities.
- Economic development/jobs – long term planning
- Invest in existing communities - Why can't we make Pontiac a place where folks want to live and have affordable housing?
- How do we expand the economic development in Pontiac - creating jobs, sustainability.
- The county is engaging in a different way - Housing and Neighborhood Development.

Group Discussion: Solutions –What we want to see

- MSHDA already requires any housing developed with tax credits must accept HCV Vouchers.
- Landlord strategies- Trial program for case managers to work with landlords.
- There is the clean slate expungement program: <https://www.safeandjustmi.org/our-work/clean-slate-for-michigan/> , <https://www.michigan.gov/whitmer/0,9309,7-387-90499-542110--,00.html>
- Training and more understanding for housing advocates in this area and how to connect folks.

Develop Strategy- Use data, look at strategy – how to get there, how to measure success.

Equitable Results Framework Steps:

1. Differentiating and understanding the connection between whole population and program population and being aware of who is most disadvantaged in terms of equitable opportunities to achieve the result.
2. Using trend lines to deepen target and universal factor analysis.
3. Using factor analysis and systems thinking to inform the development of targeted and universal strategies
4. Using performance measures to track progress and ensure a meaningful contribution to equitable results.
 - a. Who is better off?
 - b. What differences did we make?



- c. How much did we do?
- d. How well did we do it?

Questions to Ask:

1. ENGAGING STAKEHOLDERS – Who’s missing and how can they be engaged? How can stakeholders from different racial/ethnic groups — especially those who may be adversely affected be meaningfully engaged?
2. DETERMINING THE STRATEGIES– What do the strategies seek to accomplish? Will it reduce disparities or discrimination?
3. CONSIDERING ADVERSE IMPACTS – What adverse impacts or unintended consequences could result from this strategy?
4. ADVANCING EQUITABLE IMPACTS – What positive impacts on equality and inclusion, if any, could result from this strategy?

Breakout Group - Services

Long-term:

- Education opportunities within community so it’s not necessary to leave neighborhood/group in the community.
- Continuum of care available 24/7, meet people where they are needing services.
- Generational poverty, those with lived experience discuss their needs.
- Multi-level housing options, for those not feeling safe in a traditional shelter, not wanting to leave their belongings. Providing heated space/shower for them to feel comfortable, and fit their needs.

Short-term:

- Trauma informed care mandated, not optional.
- Train together with law enforcement, mental health services, etc.
- VI-SPDAT changes to add equity to the tools used.
- Connect with businesses for 24 hour services.
- Challenging conventional assumptions. Provide financial assistance instead of traditional shelter to empower individuals.
- Affordable reliable internet connectivity is also a huge issue impacting low income black and brown communities.
- Eligibility Structure– not necessary for father figure to be removed to receive services. Create step-down system so receiving a raise in wages does not mean they’re ineligible for assistance. Child care, job, housing, schooling for children, all pieces work together. Boxed into poverty. Advocate at state level.



Breakout Group - Housing

- Address stigma about vouchers- public campaign/public health campaign against bias. Housing is linked to public health.
- Prepare for bias & difficulty in housing search.
- Create communities of choice, mapping systems of HUD housing maps interlaid with school districts, Noh landlords, jobs/businesses, affordable housing ordinances.
- Work with NOAH landlords to sustain those at risk.
- Housing costs need to be updated to include: childcare costs, transportation costs, healthcare costs, internet connectivity costs.
- Place burden on landlord instead of tenant to prove non-discriminatory practices.
- Rental license type regime, eg. landlords would have to report race of tenants and applicants annually.
- Testing for discriminatory housing: <https://www.fhcmichigan.org/get-involved/civil-rights-tester/#.X85l1C1h2Ak>.
 - Link our searchers with FHC.
- Unified application, with 1 fee, to save costs if rejected.
 - If landlords use same tenant application databases, can they share information within?
- App tracking landlord/tenant conversations to have a record for courts.
 - <https://www.justfix.nyc/en/>
- On the county level have landlord educational trainings prior to being granted registration certificate.
- For connection to MDHHS: https://newmibridges.michigan.gov/s/isd-communitypartner-landing?language=en_US
- Create statewide policy/law about the only valid criteria for making rental decision to standardize it.

Breakout Group - Prevention

- Landlord tenant relationships need to be worked out when repairs are needed.
 - Talk about how to improve the relationship and have a facilitated conversation. This will also help the eviction.
 - Let them know that they have legal rights regarding repairs in the lease.
 - This is something a case manager can continue to look at and question - giving them the simplest way to help their clients be up to date.
- County surveyed landlords in previous years and asked why people aren't accessing services; some people were hesitant because they can get more money, some didn't know they could access services.
- Proposed a landlord mitigation fund to get landlords engaged in utilizing programs.
- Need to develop an initiative to bring people to the table in the outreach perspective. Get the landlord engagement in a room with experts to discuss.
- Trial program for people who have evictions on their record is a strategy.



- Support case manager navigation.
- Education is needed for tenants to know what is acceptable and refundable and know their rights with regard to fees.
- Landlord/tenant guide needs to be easy to understand in bullet lists and graphs, not a dense manual.
- How to inform people who to reach out to and provide access to information needed?
 - Staff person/liaison who worked and connected clients with programs and services at the court house.
 - Getting more information to legal aid partners.
 - Getting information how in the county level - can be a staff member who rotates and/or have a judge set one day to specifically focus on eviction cases and that same day appoint a staff member to assist specifically for that.
 - Succession planning amongst staff and offices (to have longevity).
- Agencies need to collaboratively work together instead of creating layers of difficulty for participants.
- Need to let tenants know they can reach out earlier rather than later when they have 5k+ debt in rent.
- Prevention dollars for eviction unfortunately don't cover after a certain amount for legal fees.
- How to target the disproportionate numbers of BIPOC?
 - Additional assessments for prioritization: people who follow-up, folks who have historically been 'burned' from the system.
 - Having folks build trust and getting folks who are representative of the population working as case managers and/or a part of grassroots housing justice group.
- Remove extra state requirements beyond federal requirements for eligibility. Agencies should match criteria with each other, without additional requirements.
- Pool prevention assistance funds to include utilities, etc., to prevent evictions.
- Unify screening parameters, self-advocacy, and teach tenants their rights.
- Step-by-step video to walk through paperwork process eliminates excuse of difficulty for landlords.
- Resilience skills, coping skills, self-care.
- State-level policy of a step-down system of decreasing benefits is needed to help folks as they are getting off assistance.

Next Steps:

- Break up services group.
- Survey landlords about how COVID affects them.
- Connect in big group first, then discuss finer details in smaller groups.
- Time frame – shorter meeting - 2 hours - workgroup without introductions or a shorter intro.
- Include others in community in the next meeting.
- Email [Leah McCall](#) or [Regina Cannon](#) with questions & other input.